COVID-19 Review of national clinical practice guidelines for key questions relating to the care of pregnant women and their babies

Authorship
Declan Devane, Frances Kellie, Elaine Finucane, Claire Beecher, Vivienne Hanrahan, Aris T Papageorghiou, Zarko Alfirevic on behalf of the Cochrane Pregnancy and Childbirth COVID Group

Trusted evidence.
Informed decisions.
Better health.

pregnancy.cochrane.org
Objective & Methods

Review objective

❖ Summarise guideline recommendations for the care of pregnant women and their babies during COVID-19 pandemic

Methods

❖ Identify and review the national clinical practice guidelines that addresses each of the 14 prioritised questions

❖ Guidelines restricted to country level national, professional societies and government organisations

❖ One reviewer in each country extracted data from relevant guideline(s) and a second reviewer verified the data

❖ A consensus defined as >80% of countries having the same answer to the question posed
Questions & subgroups

1. Is it recommended that pregnant women wear a surgical mask or N-95 respirator during hospital appointments?
2. Are additional ultrasound scans (e.g. growth, Doppler, biophysical profile) indicated?
3. Are antenatal steroids for fetal lung maturation contraindicated?
4. Is it recommended to undertake URGENT delivery where maternal respiratory support is required?
5. Is vaginal birth contraindicated?
6. Is it recommended that ALL women coming into labour or nearing term have a COVID-19 swab test/Rapid antigen for Covid-19?
7. Is it contraindicated for partners of labouring women to accompany them during labour?
8. Is epidural/spinal analgesia contraindicated?
9. Is the use of Entonox during labour and birth contraindicated?
10. Is delayed umbilical cord clamping contraindicated?
11. Should a designated member of the neonatal team be present at birth?
12. Is “skin to skin” contact between the mother and baby contraindicated?
13. Is it recommended that otherwise well babies be separated from their mothers after birth?
14. Is breast feeding contraindicated?

Subgroups of interest
- COVID-19 positive (symptomatic or not)
- Symptomatic (fever, cough) but COVID-19 status unknown
- Asymptomatic, COVID-19 status unknown but at risk due to close contact with COVID-19 positive person
- Asymptomatic and not at risk due to to close contact with COVID-19 positive person
Answers

1. Yes – the guideline recommends the practice
2. Consider – the guideline states that the practice may be considered under certain conditions
3. No – the guideline advises against the practice
4. The guideline states further research is needed or there is insufficient evidence to recommend
5. The guideline recommendation is unclear
6. Guidelines within country are contradictory
7. The guideline does not mention the clinical question/There is no guideline available
19 countries with more than 10,000 COVID-19 positive cases on 10th April 2020 included
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>1st reviewer</th>
<th>2nd reviewer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Austria</td>
<td>Philipp Klaritsch</td>
<td>Martin Metzenbauer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td>Liesbeth Lewi</td>
<td>Jute Richter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brazil</td>
<td>Melania Maria Ramos Amorim</td>
<td>Maíra Libertad Soligo Takemoto</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>Rohan D’Souza</td>
<td>A. Kinga Malinowski</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>Hong Jiang</td>
<td>Xu Qian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>Laurent J Salomon</td>
<td>Marine Driessen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>Kurt Hecher</td>
<td>Ekkehard Schleussner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iran</td>
<td>Shayesteh Jahanfar</td>
<td>Parvin Abedi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Israel</td>
<td>Yoav Yinon</td>
<td>Lior Drukker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>Tamara Stampalija</td>
<td>Enrico Ferrazzi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>Wessel Ganzevoort</td>
<td>Elisabeth van Leeuwen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portugal</td>
<td>Inês Martins</td>
<td>Diogo Ayres-de-Campos</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russia</td>
<td>Alexey Kholin</td>
<td>Roman Shmakov</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Korea</td>
<td>Ja-Young Kwon</td>
<td>Hayan Kwon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>Maria Goya</td>
<td>Montse Palacio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td>Michel Boulvain</td>
<td>Nicole Oechsenbein-Kölble</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>Cagri Gulumser</td>
<td>Metin Gülmezoglu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>Zarko Alfrevic</td>
<td>Aris Papageorghiou</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United States</td>
<td>David M. Haas</td>
<td>Nimisha Kumar</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Analysis

• We explored the level of consensus in recommendations for each question across countries by looking at the number of countries within which a guideline was available that addressed the target question(s) i.e., for each question, we excluded countries in which there was no guideline or the guideline did not address the specific question or where guidelines within countries were contradictory.

• We set consensus levels at 80% i.e., where 80% of countries with a guideline that addressed the question made the same recommendation.
Consensus
(where 80% of countries with a guideline that addressed the question made the same recommendation)

❖ Pregnant women who are COVID-19 positive
  • Should wear a surgical mask or N-95 respirator during hospital appointments
  • Vaginal birth is not contraindicated
  • Epidural/spinal analgesia is not contraindicated

❖ Pregnant women who are symptomatic but COVID-19 status unknown
  • Should wear a surgical mask or N-95 respirator during hospital appointments
  • Vaginal birth is not contraindicated
  • Epidural/spinal analgesia is not contraindicated

❖ Pregnant women who are asymptomatic and status unknown and at risk
  • Should wear a surgical mask or N-95 respirator during hospital appointments
  • Vaginal birth is not contraindicated
  • Epidural/spinal analgesia is not contraindicated
  • Delayed umbilical cord clamping is not contraindicated

❖ Pregnant women who are asymptomatic AND not at risk due to close contact with known COVID-19 positive person
  • Should wear a surgical mask or N-95 respirator during hospital appointments
  • Partners of labouring women accompanying them during labour is not contraindicated
  • Delayed umbilical cord clamping is not contraindicated
Consensus not reached

Pregnant women who are COVID-19 positive
- Are additional ultrasound scans (e.g. growth, Doppler, biophysical profile) indicated?
- Are antenatal steroids for fetal lung maturation contraindicated?
- Is it contraindicated for partners of labouring women to accompany them during labour?
- Is the use of Entonox during labour and birth contraindicated?
- Is delayed umbilical cord clamping contraindicated?
- Should a designated member of the neonatal team be present at birth?
- Is “skin to skin” contact between the mother and baby contraindicated?
- Is it recommended that otherwise well babies be separated from their mothers after birth?
- Is breast feeding contraindicated?

Pregnant women who are symptomatic but COVID-19 status unknown
- Are additional ultrasound scans (e.g. growth, Doppler, biophysical profile) indicated?
- Are antenatal steroids for fetal lung maturation contraindicated?
- Is it contraindicated for partners of labouring women to accompany them during labour?
- Is the use of Entonox during labour and birth contraindicated?
- Is delayed umbilical cord clamping contraindicated?
- Should a designated member of the neonatal team be present at birth?
- Is “skin to skin” contact between the mother and baby contraindicated?
- Is it recommended that otherwise well babies be separated from their mothers after birth?
- Is breast feeding contraindicated?
Consensus not reached

- Pregnant women who are asymptomatic and status unknown and at risk
  - Are antenatal steroids for fetal lung maturation contraindicated?
  - Is it contraindicated for partners of labouring women to accompany them during labour?
  - Is the use of Entonox during labour and birth contraindicated?
  - Should a designated member of the neonatal team be present at birth?
  - Is “skin to skin” contact between the mother and baby contraindicated?
  - Is it recommended that otherwise well babies be separated from their mothers after birth?
  - Is breast feeding contraindicated?

- Pregnant women who are asymptomatic AND not at risk due to close contact with known COVID-19 positive person
  - Is the use of Entonox during labour and birth contraindicated?

- All women
  - Is it recommended to undertake URGENT delivery where maternal respiratory support is required
  - Is it recommended that ALL women coming into labour or nearing term have a COVID-19 swab test/Rapid antigen for Covid-19?
It is important to note that this work does not make recommendations. Rather, it identifies, collates and summarises clinical practice guideline recommendations on key clinical questions available across a number of countries. We also explored the level of consensus in recommendations for each question across countries.

No formal quality assessment of included guidelines was undertaken and we do not endorse recommendations from any country.

Recommendations from individual countries may differ from guidance by international organisations.
Is it recommended that pregnant women wear a surgical mask or N-95 respirator during hospital appointments?

- COVID-19 positive: 17
- Symptomatic but COVID-19 status unknown: 17
- Asymptomatic and status unknown and at risk: 11
- Asymptomatic AND not at risk due to close contact with known COVID-19 positive person: 9

Counts (n):

- Yes—it is recommended: 18
- No—it is not recommended: 2
- Guideline does not mention/No guideline: 6
- Recommendation unclear: 8
Are additional ultrasound scans (e.g. growth, Doppler, biophysical profile) indicated?

- Yes-additional USSs are indicated: 4 (COVID-19 positive), 1 (Symptomatic but COVID-19 status unknown)
- Consider: 4 (COVID-19 positive), 2 (Symptomatic but COVID-19 status unknown)
- No-additional USSs not indicated: 3 (COVID-19 positive), 4 (Symptomatic but COVID-19 status unknown)
- Guideline does not mention/No guideline: 8 (COVID-19 positive), 11 (Symptomatic but COVID-19 status unknown)
- Recommendation unclear: 1 (Symptomatic but COVID-19 status unknown)
Are antenatal steroids for fetal lung maturation contraindicated?

*Yes-contraindicated/No-not contraindicated (COVID-19 positive (symptomatic or not))
Is it recommended to undertake URGENT delivery where maternal respiratory support is required

- Yes—it is recommended: 3 countries
- Consider: 8 countries
- Guideline does not mention/No guideline: 7 countries
- Recommendation unclear: 1 country
Is vaginal birth contraindicated?

- COVID-19 positive
- Symptomatic but COVID-19 status unknown
- Asymptomatic and status unknown and at risk

*Consider/Guidelines does not mention (all 3 groups)
Is it recommended that ALL women coming into labour or nearing term have a COVID-19 swab test/Rapid antigen for Covid-19?

*Guideline does not mention/guideline recommendation is unclear*
Is it contraindicated for partners of labouring women to accompany them during labour?

- **Yes-contraindicated**
- **Consider**
- **No-not contraindicated**
- **Guideline does not mention/No guideline**
- **Recommendation unclear**
- **Guidelines contradictory***

*No-not contraindicated/Guidelines does not mention (COVID-19 positive & Symptomatic but COVID-19 status unknown groups)
*Consider/Guidelines does not mention (Asymptomatic and status unknown and at risk group)
*Yes-contraindicated/No-not contraindicated (all groups)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Countries (n)</th>
<th>Consider</th>
<th>No-not contraindicated</th>
<th>Guideline does not mention/No guideline</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>COVID-19 positive</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Symptomatic but COVID-19 status unknown</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Is the use of Entonox during labour and birth contraindicated?

- COVID-19 positive
- Symptomatic but COVID-19 status unknown
- Asymptomatic and status unknown and at risk

*Yes-contraindicated/Guidelines does not mention (all groups)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Condition</th>
<th>COVID-19 positive</th>
<th>Symptomatic but COVID-19 status unknown</th>
<th>Asymptomatic and status unknown and at risk</th>
<th>Asymptomatic AND not at risk due to close contact with known COVID-19 positive person</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes-contraindicated</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No-not contradicated</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guideline does not mention/No guideline</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guidelines contradictory*</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Yes-contraindicated/Consider (COVID-19 positive & Symptomatic but COVID-19 status unknown groups)

*Consider/Guidelines does not mention (Asymptomatic and status unknown and at risk group)
*Guidelines does not mention/Guideline recommendation is unclear (COVID-19 positive (symptomatic or not))
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Yes-contraindicated</th>
<th>Not-contraindicated</th>
<th>Further research/Insufficient evidence</th>
<th>Guideline does not mention/No guideline</th>
<th>Guidelines contradictory*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>COVID-19 positive</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Symptomatic but COVID-19 status unknown</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asymptomatic and status unknown and at risk</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Yes-contraindicated/No-not contraindicated (COVID-19 positive (symptomatic or not))
*Yes-contraindicated/Consider (COVID-19 positive & Symptomatic but COVID-19 status unknown groups)
*Consider/Guidelines does not mention (Asymptomatic and status unknown and at risk group) (x2)
*No-not contraindicated/Guidelines does not mention (COVID-19 positive & Symptomatic but COVID-19 status unknown groups)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>COVID-19 positive</th>
<th>Symptomatic but COVID-19 status unknown</th>
<th>Asymptomatic and status unknown and at risk</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes-it is recommended</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consider</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No-it is not recommended</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guideline does not mention/No guideline</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendation unclear</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guidelines contradictory*</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Yes-contraindicated/Consider (COVID-19 positive & Symptomatic but COVID-19 status unknown groups)
*Consider/Guidelines does not mention (Asymptomatic and status unknown and at risk group)
Is breast feeding contraindicated?

- Yes-contraindicated
- Consider
- No-not contraindicated

COVID-19 positive
Symptomatic but COVID-19 status unknown
Asymptomatic and status unknown and at risk

*Yes-contraindicated/Consider (all three groups)
Cochrane Pregnancy and Childbirth COVID Group

Study Management Team
• Declan Devane, National University of Ireland Galway & Cochrane Ireland
• Zarko Alfirevic, Cochrane Pregnancy and Childbirth Group & University of Liverpool
• Frances Kellie, Cochrane Pregnancy and Childbirth Group & University of Liverpool
• Elaine Finucane, National University of Ireland Galway
• Claire Beecher, National University of Ireland Galway
• Vivienne Hanrahan, National University of Ireland Galway
• Aris T Papageorghiou, University of Oxford

Collaborators
• Zarko Alfirevic, Cochrane Pregnancy and Childbirth Group & University of Liverpool, UK
• Aris T Papageorghiou, University of Oxford, UK
• Philipp Klaritsch, Medical University of Graz, Austria
• Martin Metzenbauer, TwoCare – Prenatal Medicine Center, Vienna, Austria
• Liesbeth Lewi, University Hospitals Leuven, Belgium
• Jute Richter, University Hospitals Leuven, Belgium
• Melanie Maria Ramos Amorim, Medical School, Campina Grande Federal University, Campina Grande, Paraíba, Brazil
• Máirta Libertad Soligo Takemoto, Botucatu Medical School, São Paulo State University (UNESP), Botucatu, São Paulo, Brazil
• Rohan D’Souza, Sinai Health System – Mount Sinai Hospital, Toronto, Canada
• A. Kinga Malinowski, Sinai Health System – Mount Sinai Hospital, Toronto, Canada
• Hong Jiang, School of Public Health, Fudan University, China
• Xu Qian, School of Public Health, Fudan University, China
• Laurent J SALOMON, Necker-Enfants Malades, AP-HP, Université de Paris, Paris, France
• Marine DRIESSEN, Necker-Enfants Malades, AP-HP, Université de Paris, Paris, France
• Kurt Hecher, Dept. of Obstetrics and Fetal Medicine, University Medical Center Hamburg-Eppendorf, Hamburg, Germany
• Ekkehard Schleussner, Jena University Hospital, Friedrich Schiller University, Germany
• Parvin Abedi, Ahvaz Jundishapur University of Medical Sciences, Ahvaz, Iran
• Shayesteh Jahanfar, Central Michigan University, Michigan, USA
Cochrane Pregnancy and Childbirth COVID Group

**Collaborators cont’d**

- Yoav Yinon, Sheba Medical Center, Israel
- Lior Drukker, University of Oxford, UK
- Tamara Stampalija, Department of Medical, Surgical and Health Sciences, University of Trieste, Italy
- Enrico Ferrazzi, Fondazione IRCCS Ca’ Granda Ospedale Maggiore Policlinico, Milano, Italy.
- Wessel Ganzevoort, Amsterdam UMC, Netherlands.
- Elisabeth van Leeuwen, Amsterdam UMC, Netherlands.
- Inês Martins, CHULN - Santa Maria Hospital – Lisbon, Portugal.
- Diogo Ayres-de-Campos, Faculty of Medicine, University of Lisbon, Portugal.
- Alexey Kholin, National Medical Research Center for Obstetrics, Gynecology & Perinatology, Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation, Russia.
- Ja-Young, Yonsei University College of Medicine, Severance Hospital, Yonsei University Healthsystem, Seoul, Korea.
- Hayan Kwon, Yonsei University College of Medicine, Severance Hospital, Yonsei University Healthsystem, Seoul, Korea.
- Maria Goya, Hospital Vall d’Hebron, Barcelona, Spain.
- Michel Boulvain, GHOL, Hôpital de Nyon, Switzerland.
- Nicole Ochsenbein-Kölble, University Hospital Zurich, Switzerland.
- Cagri Gulumser, Turkey.
- Metin Gülmezoglu, Concept Foundation Executive Director, Turkey.
- David M. Haas, Indiana University School of Medicine, USA.
- Nimisha Kumar, Indiana University School of Medicine, USA.